CITY OF ST. LOUIS CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES FEBRUARY 27, 2012

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Richard Callow, Chairman Anthony Robinson Alderman Antonio French David Visintainer

CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT

Betsy H. Bradley, Director Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member David Visintainer moved to approve the January 23, 2012 minutes. Hearing no objection, the minutes were approved.

Mr. Visintainer then moved to approve the current agenda. Hearing no objection, the agenda was approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2012.0249 1412 MISSISSIPPI AVE. LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Diversified Real Estate Group – John Muller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of an application to construct two (2)

single family dwellings.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation

including the site, the proposed site plan and an overview of the surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the project concept, but that the developer be directed to continue to work with the Cultural Resources Office staff to refine elements and details of the design. The proposal appears to comply with the existing Lafayette Square Historic District Standards and adhere to the proposed

revised standards as well.

Page 2 of 7

Mr. John Muller testified that he intends to continue to work with the Cultural Resources Office staff to refine the design.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the proposed new buildings conform to the requirements of the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards;
- the project design is preliminary and details regarding cornice, window and door details have not yet been finalized;
- plans have been submitted to the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee, who have indicated their support for the project; and
- that no comment regarding the proposal was received from the Alderman of the ward.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the project subject to the applicant working with the Cultural Resources Office to refine elements and details of the design. The motion was made by Board Member Antonio French and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2012.0095 4136 FLAD AVENUE

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Land Reutilization Authority Applicnat: David & Amanda Baca

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of an application to construct a single

family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation

including the site, the proposed site plan and an overview of the surrounding area. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval with the stipulation that the final design details and materials be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The staff considers that the proposed design will be compatible with the surrounding historic fabric and contribute to restoring some consistency to the block face, even though

Page 3 of 7

certain elements may not strictly comply with the historic district standards.

David Baca, property owner, testified on his own behalf regarding the windows of the house.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the proposed design generally conforms to the requirements of the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District Standards;
- the somewhat larger scale of the house is acceptable on this site, given that the buildings adjacent on either side exhibit disparity of scale and massing;
- the project design is preliminary and details regarding window muntin design and other elements have not yet been finalized;
- plans have been submitted to the Shaw Neighborhood Improvement Association, which has indicated its support for the project;
- the owner's request to use interior muntins on the sides and rear of the building is reasonable, given the additional cost and the reduced visibility of these elevations; and
- no comment regarding the proposal was received from the Alderman of the ward.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the general design with the stipulation that the final design details and materials be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. French. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW APPLICATION

C. 2012.0189 3663 FOREST PARK PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner: Amrut & Sita Patel

Applicant: ADDA Environmental – AG Mack

Page 4 of 7

DEMOLITION PLAN: Review of applicant's demolition permit as granted on

September 27, 2010.

PREVIOUS ACTION: September 2, 2010 – Preliminary review submitted to

construct a 5 story hotel.

September 27, 2010 - The Preservation Board voted to grant preliminary approval to the demolition permit, instructing the Cultural Resources Office to withhold approval of the demolition permit application until the owner applied for a building permit for a hotel building

similar to the design presented at the meeting.

PROCEEDINGS: Betsy Bradley made a presentation about the property,

past Board actions and community consultations. She stated that she had received letters from 17th Ward Alderman Joseph Roddy, the Park Central Development Corporation, and the St. Louis Community Credit Union, which is a neighbor to the east of the property, in support of the demolition. Ms. Bradley recommended that the Preservation Board grant approval of the demolition.

Ankit Patel, representing his family's company, SASAK Corporation, explained the reasons for the delay to construct a hotel on the site. Mr. Patel also stated the property would be fenced and seeded with grass.

Ron Coleman, Neighborhood Stabilization Officer for the 17th Ward, testified in support of the demolition.

Darryl Orr of the St. Louis Community Credit Union testified in support of the demolition. Mr. Orr stated he believes the building is a safety hazard for the Credit Union next door.

Dan Krasnoff of the Central Park Development Corporation for the 17th Ward, testified in support of the demolition. He submitted a letter of support for the demolition. He stated he believes the hotel will be built when the economy improves.

Page 5 of 7

Ruth Keenoy, representing Landmarks Association of St. Louis, testified in opposition to the demolition without any requirement of plans for new construction at this time.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the owners of the property at 3663 Forest Park had been granted preliminary approval of the demolition by the Preservation Board at its September 27, 2010 meeting, with the condition that the Cultural Resources Office withhold approval of the demolition permit application until the owner applies for a building permit for a hotel building similar to the design presented at the meeting;
- the property is in disrepair and incidents of nuisance activities have occurred in the last year; and
- that the owner intends to proceed with the hotel project when economic conditions improve.

ACTION:

The deteriorated condition of the property combined with the testimony of the Neighborhood Stabilization Officer regarding vandalism and entry of the property by trespassers, and the testimony of the neighbors regarding hazards to their safety and effects on their commercial enterprises, and taking into account the testimony of the neighborhood organization, and finding the Applicant credible in his commitment to build the hotel as approved by the Board, it was the decision of the Preservation Board to remove the condition of the immediate issuance of a building permit from the demolition permit as approved. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. Aldermen Antonio French opposed the motion. The motion passed 2 to 1.

APPEAL OF DENIAL

D. 2011.2156 2846 SHENANDOAH AVE. FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Don Monshausen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit to retain a

front storm door installed without a permit.

Page 6 of 7
PROCEEDINGS:

As this was an appeal of a staff denial, and therefore a final decision under Chapter 536 RSMO., Mr. Don Monshausen was informed that a quorum was not present, and that he was not required to proceed at this time. Mr. Monshausen asked to proceed and waived the right to a quorum. The Board proceeded to hear his appeal at his request.

Bob Bettis presented a PowerPoint presentation including the site, the installed storm door, and an overview of the surrounding area. Mr. Bettis submitted certified copies of Ordinances #64689 and #66098 into the record. He recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial as the completed work is not in compliance with the Fox Park Historic District Standards. He stated that the staff had not received any comments from the Alderwoman or any neighborhood group regarding the project.

Don Monshausen testified on his own behalf. He presented energy bills into the record showing a reduced cost in energy since installing the doors.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the completed work is not in compliance with the Fox Park Historic District Standards which require that new storm doors be compatible with the doors behind;
- the owner installed the storm doors and transom without a permit;
- the owner is in housing court for the violation;
- after receiving a court summons, the owner applied for a permit for the storm doors and transom which was denied by the Cultural Resources Office as the storm doors and transom did not comply with the Fox Park Historic District Standards;
- the cost to repair the original doors and frames would be approximately \$5,000-\$6,000;
- the owner did not provide evidence of economic hardship that would result from replacement of the storm door system, beyond utility bills;

Page 7 of 7

- there would be no way to modify the installed doors to make them compliant under the Fox Park Standards; and
- that there were no comments from the 6th Ward Alderwoman or the Fox Park Neighborhood Association regarding the project.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the denial of a building permit to retain the storm doors and transom, installed without a permit, as they do not comply with the Fox Park Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. French. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Report on proposed new Preservation Review Districts in Wards 14, 18 and 22.

Hyde Park Historic District Expansion: Introduction and Recommendation, Ward 3.

(These two items were Deferred to the March 26, 2012 regularly scheduled meeting.)